

Table 1. Comparing Carbon Pricing Proposals

Bill	Energy Innovation and Carbon Dividend Act	American Opportunity Carbon Fee Act	Stemming Warming and Augmenting Pay Act	Climate Action Rebate Act	Raise Wages, Cut Carbon Act	America Wins Act
(Sponsor and Cosponsors)	(Ted Deutch and 58 cosponsors)	(Sheldon Whitehouse, Brian Schatz, Martin Heinrich, Kirsten Gillibrand)	(Francis Rooney, Dan Lipinski)	(Chris Coons, Diane Feinstein)	(Dan Lipinski, Francis Rooney)	(John Larson)
Initial Tax Rate (per metric ton)	\$15	\$52	\$30 (\$2021)	\$15	\$44	\$52
Annual Adjustments	\$10 + inflation	6% + inflation	5% + inflation	\$15 + inflation	2.5% + inflation	6% + inflation
Starting Year	2020	2020	2021	2020	2020	2020
Revenue Use	Taxable Carbon Dividends	Tax Credits, Social Security Beneficiary Payments, State Block Grants (\$10 billion)	70%: Payroll Tax Cuts 10%: Social Security Beneficiary Payments 10%: Block Grants for Low-Income Assistance 10%: Adaptation, energy efficiency and advanced research and development	70%: Taxable Carbon Dividends to single filers (income <\$100k, phase out from \$80k to \$100k), joint filers (income <\$150k, phase out from \$130k to \$150k) 20%: Infrastructure 5%: Research and Development 5%: Transitional Assistance	94%: Payroll Tax Cuts and Increases to Social Security Benefits 5%: Low-Income Home Energy 1%: Weatherization Assistance	54%: Infrastructure Spending 43%: Consumer Tax Refunds to Low Income Households 3%: Transitional Assistance
Automatic Adjustment Mechanism	Yes: Additional \$5 price increase	No	Yes: Additional \$3 price increase every other year	Yes: Additional \$15 price increase	No	No
Covered Gases	All Greenhouse Gases	All Greenhouse Gases	All Greenhouse Gases	All Greenhouse Gases	Energy-Related Carbon Dioxide Emissions	Energy-Related Carbon Dioxide Emissions
Exemptions	Farms, Armed Forces	None	Ozone-depleting substances (if Kigali Amendment has been ratified)	None	None	None
Fluorinated GHG Fee	10%	10% to 100% (10% adjustment from 2022 to 2031)	100%	20%	10%	N/A
CCS Refunds	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes (with restrictions)	Yes	Yes
Border Adjustments	Emissions-Intensive and Trade Exposed; i.e., Iron, Steel, Steel Mill Products, Aluminum, Cement, Glass, Pulp, Paper, Chemicals, Industrial Ceramics	Energy-Intensive Manufactured Goods; Energy costs greater than 5% of total cost	All Manufacturing Sectors (and metal ore, soda ash, and phosphate processors) with 5%+ GHG intensity and 15%+ trade intensity	Emissions-Intensive and Trade Exposed; i.e., Iron, Steel, Steel Mill Products, Aluminum, Cement, Glass, Pulp, Paper, Chemicals, Industrial Ceramics	Rebates/credits for fossil fuel exports; taxes applied to "imported taxable products"	Rebates/credits for fossil fuel exports; carbon equivalency fee applied to imports of "carbon-intensive goods"
Regulatory Action	Suspends GHG related	Not specified	Moratorium on most GHG	Not specified	Suspends GHG related	Not specified
State Law Preemption	No	Not specified	No, but declining credits for carbon price payments to states	No	Not specified	Not specified

Source: Marc Hafstead, [The Year of the Carbon Pricing Proposal](#), Resources Magazine, Resources for the Future, August 2, 2019.